



Selection Appeals Policy and Procedures

Version control		
Document name	Selection Appeals Policy and Procedure	
Owner	GP Training Academic Council	
Author	Donna Wrightson	
Version	Version 1.0	
Approved	GP Training Academic Council	
Date	17/06/2026	

Contents

Contents.....	2
1.0 Purpose.....	3
2.0 Scope.....	3
2.1 Out of Scope	3
2.1.1 Lack of understanding.....	3
2.1.2 Dissatisfaction with assessment or interview results.....	3
2.1.3 Complaints	4
3.0 Policy statement	4
3.1 General Principles	4
3.1.1 Non-retaliation.....	4
3.3 Grounds for making an appeal.....	4
3.3.1 Apparent procedural irregularity	4
3.3.2 Apparent marking irregularity or error	4
3.3.3 Mitigating circumstances.....	4
3.4 Submitting an appeal	5
3.4.1 Informal review	5
3.4.2 Formal appeal.....	5
3.5 Formal appeal process	5
3.5.1 Grounds to proceed	5
3.5.2 Selection Appeals Committee.....	6
3.5.3 Rulings	7
3.6 Outcome of decisions and data management.....	7
4.0 Related and supporting documentation	7
5.0 Contact	7
6.0 Review.....	8

1.0 Purpose

The purpose of this policy is to outline the mechanism to allow a candidate to appeal the results of their selection summative assessments, thus impacting the outcome of their application to the National Specialist Training Programme in General Practice (GP Training Programme) of the Irish College of GPs (College).

2.0 Scope

This policy applies to all candidates participating in the GP Training Programme's selection process and relates to the specific selection summative assessments. Selection summative assessments are graded against a standard or benchmark, have defined deadlines, and directly affect selection for the GP Training Programme.

The selection summative assessments are:

- Situational Judgement Test (SJT)
- Clinical Problem-Solving Test (CPST)
- Scenario-Based Competency Assessment (SBCA)

The policy does not apply to appeals regarding other training or non-training related decisions made on behalf of the College with respect to candidates.

2.1 Out of Scope

2.1.1 Lack of understanding

Lack of understanding or awareness of the GP Training Programme selection terms and conditions, policies or guidance issued to candidates does not constitute grounds for appeal.

2.1.2 Dissatisfaction with assessment or interview results

This policy does not cover dissatisfaction with results or the academic judgement of the Marking Examiners. Academic judgment is a judgment that is made about a matter where only the opinion of an academic expert is sufficient. A decision regarding assessment, competency, or progression will usually involve academic judgement. Specifically, this means that an appeal against marks awarded cannot be accepted



just because a candidate is unhappy, disappointed or disagrees with the grade awarded. Candidates should note that all decisions relating to academic judgement are final.

2.1.3 Complaints

This policy does not cover concerns raised about the provision or quality of service offered by the College. This includes issues such as staff conduct and regulation or procedure disputes. These will be defined as complaints and will not be considered under the appeals process.

On occasion it may initially be unclear whether a query is within scope or not. The College reserves the right to reclassify appeals to complaints or vice versa, after consulting with the person raising the query.

3.0 Policy statement

An appeal is defined as a request for a review of a decision made by the GP Training Selection Committee during the recruitment process for the GP training programme. This may cover any stage of the recruitment process.

3.1 General Principles

3.1.1 Non-retaliation

The College prohibits retaliation against a candidate who, in good faith, submits an appeal under this policy.

3.3 Grounds for making an appeal

3.3.1 Apparent procedural irregularity

Appeals will be considered where a candidate can demonstrate that there has been, on the balance of probability, a breach of selection procedures or regulations on the part of the College, which the candidate reasonably believes has adversely affected their performance or result.

3.3.2 Apparent marking irregularity or error

Appeals will be considered where a candidate can demonstrate that there has been, on the balance of probability, a substantive error or irregularity in the conduct of the marking of the assessment. This does not include disagreement with the academic judgement of the Marking Examiners.

3.3.3 Mitigating circumstances

Appeals will be considered where there is new evidence of mitigating circumstances that were not known or available before the assessment.

Evidence of mitigating circumstances may be advanced where:

- There is new evidence of a material nature that has become available only after the initial decision was made or;
- Said new evidence was available but not produced to decision makers at the time of ruling and the appellant can provide a satisfactory explanation for his or her failure to produce this evidence.

Such evidence must be provided by the appellant at the time of appealing and include a written statement outlining the evidence, along with any supporting documentation.

3.4 Submitting an appeal

There are two stages to the appeal process. The candidate has the right to commence the process at either stage if they wish.

3.4.1 Informal review

The candidate should submit a request in writing, by email or post, to the College within 3 working days of the communication of the decision which they would like reviewed. Following receipt of the request, College staff will review the information provided. The College staff may request more information, clarification of information or a phone call with the candidate to discuss further. The College staff will communicate a response to the informal review request within 10 working days of receipt or as soon as is practicable where this is not possible.

3.4.2 Formal appeal

The candidate may not agree with the outcome of the informal review or may wish to proceed straight to formal appeal. In either of these cases, the candidate should complete and submit the Selection Appeal Form to the College within 5 working days of the communication of the decision which they would like to appeal. Any appeal that does not conform to this standard will not be considered. There is a fee of €150. This fee is refundable if the appeal is successful. All relevant documentation, evidence or other information to be relied upon by the Appellant must accompany the application for consideration. Acknowledgement of receipt of the appeal application will be sent to the appellant within 3 working days of receipt by the Admissions Assessment Manager.

3.5 Formal appeal process

3.5.1 Grounds to proceed

In the first instance an appeal will be reviewed by the National Director of Specialist Training in General Practice or his/her delegate and two senior members of college staff. They review the Selection Appeal Form and any supporting documentation provided.

If the decision is reached that the appellant has failed to make a case under the grounds for appeal stated in this policy, then the request for appeal will be denied. The decision will be communicated to the Admissions Assessment Manager responsible for selection. The Admissions Assessment Manager will arrange for the decision to be communicated to the appellant. The appeals fee will be forfeited.

If the decision is reached that the appellant has made a case under the grounds for appeal stated in this policy, then they will approve the appeal to move forward to the Appeals Committee.

3.5.2 Selection Appeals Committee

The GP Training Academic Council will establish the Selection Appeals Committee.

The Selection Appeals Committee will consist of:

- Two Members of the training body
- One External Member from another training body

No person who has been involved with the decisions related to the appeal will be included in the Selection Appeals Committee.

The Selection Appeals Committee will arrange a time to meet and consider the appeal. The appellant will be informed of this date. The appellant may withdraw their appeal at any point up to this date.

The Selection Appeals Committee will consider all the evidence available to them. They may however request further information be provided by either the appellant or other parties involved. This may include but is not limited to:

- Requesting further documentation from the appellant, College staff, examiners, etc.
- Meeting with the appellant to clarify evidence submitted.
- Meeting with other involved parties to clarify evidence submitted. This may include, but is not limited to, College staff, the Regional Programme Director, examiners, interviewers.

A written record of any meetings related to the appeal must be kept.



The Selection Appeals Committee will review the appeal in a timely manner and the College will make every reasonable effort to communicate the decision of the Selection Appeals Committee to the appellant within 3 working days of the Selection Appeals Committee Meeting. Where this is not possible, the appellant will be notified of this fact.

3.5.3 Rulings

The Selection Appeals Committee may result in one of two outcomes:

- The Selection Appeals Committee may uphold the appeal. If the appeal is upheld then there may be one of two outcomes:
 - The appellant's existing assessment may be re-marked if a substantive error is identified and this is possible.
 - The candidate's individual sitting will be voided and a refund given
- The Selection Appeals Committee may reject the appeal. The appeals fee is forfeited.

The decision of the Selection Appeals Committee is final.

3.6 Outcome of decisions and data management

The decision of the Selection Appeals Committee will be communicated in the first instance to National Director of Specialist Training in General Practice. Appellants will be notified in writing of the decision of the Selection Appeals Committee.

The Selection Appeals Committee will inform the GP Training Selection team of the decision. If the appeal was upheld, the selection team will make any necessary arrangements for the re-marking of the relevant assessment if possible. Following this the overall scoring and ranking of the appellant may be re-classified. This may affect their final ranking and any potential offer of training place on scheme.

Records of Appeals are kept on file by the College for seven (7) years from the date of the decision in compliance with GDPR.

4.0 Related and supporting documentation

- Selection Appeals Application Form
- GP Training Selections Terms and Conditions

5.0 Contact



GP Training
GPtraining@icgp.ie

6.0 Review

This policy and procedure document will be subject to review every three years from the date of approval of this document.